

**CITY OF HAMTRAMCK BOARD OF REVIEW**  
**2023 DECEMBER BOARD OF REVIEW Session Minutes**

Meeting #1                      Session: Morning

- Date and Location: December 12, 2023, City of HAMTRAMCK  
3401 EVALINE HAMTRAMCK MI 48212. Council Chambers.
- 
- Called to Order at: 9:06AM                      Closed at: 11:57AM
- Board of Review Members Present: Rezaul Chowdhury (left 9:57, excused),  
Mohammed Muhit, Gamal Alturki, Mohamed Alduais (arrived 9:19), Yeasmin  
Sultana (arrived 9:30).
- Board of Review Members Absent: Elmedina Gozic
- Public Comment Open at: 9:08am Closed at: 9:10am
- Assessor or Assessing Staff: \_ Thomas Monchak, Assessor; Ashley Fallon, Recording  
Secretary

**APPEALS MADE:**

**Petitioner #**

**Name** Shammakh, Ahlam Abdo-Hezam

**Parcel #** 41-003-03-0440-000    **Address:** 1959 Norwalk

**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption

**Support Documentation Provided?**    X **Yes**    \_\_\_ **No**

**Minute Notes:** Property owner offered testimony regarding application.

POVERTY DENIED: APPLICANT IS ABOVE CITY ASSET GUIDELINES FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 5:  
ASSETS OF \$16,526 (CHECKING ACCOUTNS AND SECOND VEHICLE) ABOVE THE \$14,000  
LIMIT.

MOTION TO DENY BY: Rezaul Chowdhury  
Name of BOR Member: Rezaul Chowdhury  
Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki  
Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit

SECOND BY: Gamal Alturki  
BOR Member Vote: **AYE**  
BOR Member Vote: **AYE**  
BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

**Petitioner #**

**Name** Taylor, Roger

**Parcel #** 41-004-02-0037-000 **Address:** 11634 St. Aubin

**Appeal Reason** Correction of Clerical Error

**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

**Minute Notes:** POVERTY APPEAL APPROVED FOR 2022'; 2023' TAXABLE VALUE SHOULD HAVE BEEN CORRECTED BACK TO THE APPROPRIATE VALUE INCLUDING THE CPI FOR 2023'

MOTION TO APPROVE BY: Mohammed Muhit

SECOND BY: Rezaul Chowdhury

Name of BOR Member: Rezaul Chowdhury

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

**Petitioner # - Batch Approval of Poverty Exemption Applications Meeting Guidelines (12 properties)**

MOTION TO APPROVE BY: Mohammed Muhit

SECOND BY: Gamal Alturki

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Yeasmin Sultana

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

**Name** Samaha, Fahd Hezam-Abdulla

**Parcel #** 41-001-01-0075-000 **Address:** 2339 Denton

**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption

**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A FULL (100%) EXEMPTION FOR 2023 TAX YEAR. APPLICANT MEETS CITY GUIDELINES FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 5.

**Name** Jannat, Husneara

**Parcel #** 41-002-04-0517-000 **Address:** 2489 Grayling

**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption

**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT MEETS CITY GUIDELINES FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 4. APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A 50% REDUCTION FOR THE 2023 TAX YEAR.

**Name** Qureshi, Ghazala N.

**Parcel #** 41-003-09-0021-000 **Address:** 9602 Dequindre

**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption

**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT MEETS THE GUIDELINES FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 1, FULL, 100%, EXEMPTION GRANTED FOR 2023 TAX YEAR.

**Name** Taylor, Roger  
**Parcel #** 41-004-02-0037-000 **Address:** 11634 St. Aubin  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A FULL (100%) EXEMPTION FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 2 BASED ON ITY GUIDELINES.

**Name** Abbas, Mohammed-Hasan-Ali  
**Parcel #** 41-004-02-0063-000 **Address:** 11422 St. Aubin  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A FULL, 100%, EXEMPTION FOR THE 2023 TAX YEAR. INCOME OF \$19,292 IS BELOW THE \$37,350 CITY GUIDELINE FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 5.

**Name** Chowdhury, Minar Ahmed  
**Parcel #** 41-004-02-0371-000 **Address:** 2344 Holmes  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED: INCOME OF \$15,324 MEETS THE CITY INCOME GUIDELINE OF \$15,630 FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF ONE. 50% REDUCTION GRATNED FOR 2023 TAX YEAR.

**Name** Kmiecik, Carol  
**Parcel #** 41-005-07-021-000 **Address:** 2993 Hanley  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - BASED ON AN INCOME OF 11,187, APPLICANT QUALIFIES UNDER CITY GUIDELINES FOR A 50% REDUCTION FOR 2023.

**Name** Al Khubari, Altaf  
**Parcel #** 41-005-08-0010-000 **Address:** 2936 Roosevelt  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A FULL (100%) EXEMPTION FOR 2023 TAX YEAR. APPLICANT MEETS CITY GUIDELINES FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 4.

**Name** Kaid, Amin  
**Parcel #** 41-005-08-0036-000 **Address:** 3092 Roosevelt  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT MEETS QUALIFICATIONS FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 7. APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A FULL (100%) EXEMPTION FOR THE 2023 TAX YEAR.



**Name** Dowkontt, Alina  
**Parcel #** 41-006-01-0118-000 **Address:** 3213 Belmont  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A FULL (100%) EXEMPTION FOR THE 2023 TAX YEARS, MEETS CITY GUIDELINES FOR A HOSEHOLD OF 1.

**Name** Sinanovic, Zekija  
**Parcel #** 41-006-04-0008-000 **Address:** 3019 Holbrook  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT QUALIFIES FOR A FULL, 100% EXEMPTION, FOR THE 2023 TAX YEAR. APPLICANT MEETS THE GUIDELINES FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 1.

**Name** Ambia, Akhlaqul  
**Parcel #** 41-008-01-0362-000 **Address:** 5153 Belmont  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY GRANTED - APPLICANT MEETS CITY GUIDELINES FOR A HOSEHOLD OF 1, 50% REDUCTION GRANTED FOR 2023 TAX YEAR.

**Petitioner # - Batch Denial of Poverty Exemption Applications Not Meeting Guidelines (10 properties)**

MOTION TO DENY BY: Mohammed Muhit      SECOND BY: Yeasmin Sultana

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki	BOR Member Vote: <b>AYE</b>
Name of BOR Member: Yeasmin Sultana	BOR Member Vote: <b>AYE</b>
Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit	BOR Member Vote: <b>AYE</b>

**Name** Tagaddin, Ebrahim  
**Parcel #** 41-002-04-0184-000 **Address:** 2338 Faber  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - \$109,000 IN DEPOSITS IN SEPTEMBER 2022, ASSUMED TO BE GIFTS, PUTS APPLICANT ABOVE THE CITY ASSET TEST. ALSO MISSING BANK INFORMATION FOR SAVINGS ACCOUNT ENDING IN 5921.

**Name** Homran, Ali M.  
**Parcel #** 41-003-03-0252-000 **Address:** 2012 Evaline  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - ASSETS OF \$15,900 EXCEEDS THE CITY GUIDELINE OF \$14,000 FOR A FAMILY OF 5.

**Name** Obeid, Yakoob Abdo-Kaid  
**Parcel #** 41-004-01-0049-000 **Address:** 2699 Neibel  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☐ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - VERBALLY STATED THAT PUT \$70,000 DOWN ON HOME FOR PURCHASE VIA LAND CONTRACT, APPLICATION SHOWS \$23,000 IN LOANS FROM FAMILY AND FRIENDS, PAPERWORK PROVIDED SHOWS \$35,000 IN LOANS. ACCOUNTS DO NOT SHOW THE ADDITIONAL (UP TO) \$35,000 SOURCE, OR WHERE IT CAME FROM TO PURCHASE. THE ADDITIONAL \$35,000 PUTS APPLICANT ABOVE THE CITY ASSET GUIDELINES.

**Name** Abedin, Joyanal  
**Parcel #** 41-007-09-0035-000 **Address:** 12115 Gallagher  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - ASSETS OF \$24,629 ABOVE CITY LIMIT OF \$14,000 FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 6.

**Name** Islam, Nurul  
**Parcel #** 41-007-13-0231-000 **Address:** 11406 Moran  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - APPLICANT IS OVER CITY GUIDELINES OF A HOUSEHOLD OF 6, INCOME OF \$58,988 IS ABOVE THE CITY LIMIT OF \$42,770 FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 6.

**Name** Uddin, Aftab  
**Parcel #** 41-007-14-0263-000 **Address:** 12080 Gallagher  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - ASSETS OF \$19,637 ABOVE CITY GUIDELINES OF \$14,000.

**Name** Ahmed, Salim U.  
**Parcel #** 41-007-15-0065-000 **Address:** 2603 Casmere  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - APPLICANT OWNS SECOND HOME AT 2600 WHALEN, WITH A CURRENT SEV OF \$135,100, AND IS ABOVE THE CITY ASSET TEST.

**Name** Ragland, Jacqueline  
**Parcel #** 41-008-01-0369-000 **Address:** 5195 Belmont  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - APPLICANT DOES NOT MEET CITY GUIDELINES FOR A POVERTY EXEMPTION FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 1. INCOME OF \$15,924 IS ABOVE THE CITY GUIDELINE LIMIT OF \$15,630.

**Name** Al Samet, Mufeed Saleh-Abbas  
**Parcel #** 41-008-02-0036-301 **Address:** 3921 Norwalk  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - ABOVE CITY GUIDELINES FOR A HOUSEHOLD OF 5, ADJUSTED INCOME OF \$40,699 ABOVE CITY LIMIT OF \$37,350.

**Name** Begum, Jaheda  
**Parcel #** 41-008-02-0140-304 **Address:** 3922 Caniff  
**Appeal Reason** Poverty Exemption  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** POVERTY DENIED - CASH GIFTS FROM RELATIVES TOTALLING \$30,000 FROM MORTGAGE APPLICATION IS ABOVE THE \$14,000 ASSET LIMIT OF THE CITY.

**Petitioner #2023-D033**

**Name** Alzragi, Wadee Noman-Mohamed  
**Parcel #** 41-002-04-0163-301 **Address:** 2460 Faber  
**Appeal Reason** Correcting Qualified Error  
**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No  
**Minute Notes:** 2023-12-11 CORRECT BUILDING ASSESSED & TAXABLE VALUE, INCORRECT DEPRECIATION USED FOR ENTIRE BUILDING, CALCULATED CORRECTED WEIGHTED DEPRECIATION FOR ENTIRE PROPERTY. CALCULATING CORRECT DEPRECIATION FOR EXISTING PORTION AND ADDITIONS OF BUILDING, CAUSING A REDUCTION IN ADDITIONS FOR 2023.

MOTION TO APPROVE BY: Gamal Alturki                      SECOND BY:    Mohammed Muhit

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki	BOR Member Vote: <b>AYE</b>
Name of BOR Member: Yeasmin Sultana	BOR Member Vote: <b>AYE</b>
Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit	BOR Member Vote: <b>AYE</b>



**Petitioner # 2023-D025, 2023-D024**

**Name** Alzaba, Ahmed

**Parcel #** 41-002-04-0161-000 **Address:** 2472 Faber

**Appeal Reason** Correcting Clerical Error

**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

**Minute Notes:** CORRECT BUILDING ASSESSED & TAXABLE VALUE, BASED ON FIELD VISIT ON 08/22/2023 BY C.F.T. & A.H.F. REVIEWED NEW ADDITION & EXISTING BUILDING. CORRECT ORIGINAL FOUNDATION TO "MICHIGAN BASEMENT" FROM BASEMENT & CRAWL, SQUARE FOOTAGE, AND EFFECTIVE AGE OF BUILDING. FOR 2022 ADDITION IS 50% COMPLETE, FOR 2023 ADDITION IS 100% COMPLETE. T.D.M. 2023-08-24

MOTION TO APPROVE BY: Gamal Alturki

SECOND BY: Yeasmin Sultana

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Yeasmin Sultana

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

**Petitioner #2023-D026**

**Name** Akhtar, Fatema

**Parcel #** 41-003-01-0072-300 **Address:** 2719 Poland

**Appeal Reason** Correcting Clerical Error

**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

**Minute Notes:** REMOVE VALUE (CORRECTION TO RECORD): FIELD INSPECTION WITH OWNER 8-30-23: REMOVE BASEMENT FINISH AND KITCHEN BUILT INS AS A REDUCTION TO OVERALL VALUE. (\$4200 LOSS/LOSSES REMOVED FROM ADDITIONS OF \$9400) DBOR

MOTION TO APPROVE BY: Mohammed Muhit

SECOND BY: Gamal Alturki

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Yeasmin Sultana

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

**Petitioner #2023-D031, 2023-D030**

**Name** Ahmed, Salim U.

**Parcel #** 41-007-15-0065-000 **Address:** 2603 Casmere

**Appeal Reason** Clerical Error - Uncapping

**Support Documentation Provided?** ☒ Yes ☐ No

**Minute Notes:** UNCAP (2019 SALE) RECALCULATE 2022, 2023. 2023-12-05 PTA WAS REC'D IN 2019' AND ENTERED HOWEVER NOT UNCAPPED, CLERICAL ERROR BY ASSESSOR. CORRECT AT DBOR 23' THE 2022' AND 2023' TAXABLE VALUE (CURRENT AND ONE YEAR CAN BE ADJUSTED)

MOTION TO APPROVE BY: Mohammed Muhit

SECOND BY: Yeasmin Sultana

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Yeasmin Sultana

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

**Petitioner #2023-D032**

**Name** The Bengal Auto Sales LLC

**Parcel #** 41-007-16-0143-300 **Address:** 11469 Joseph Campau

**Appeal Reason** Omitted Building

**Support Documentation Provided?** X Yes \_\_\_ No

**Minute Notes:** CORRECT 2023 VALUES. BUILDING OMITTED (COMPLETED 2022). PERMIT FOR NEW BUILDING 2022' COMPLETED FOR 2023' ROLL. OMITTED PROPERTY, ADD 500SF OFFICE BUILDING TO 2023' ROLL PLUS ADDITION OF 2' BRICK WALL. ADJUSTED EXISTING FENCE TO CORRECTED DETAIL AND REDUCED EXISTING ASPHALT PAVING BY 500SF (AREA OF BUILDING)

MOTION TO APPROVE BY: Gamal Alturki

SECOND BY: Mohammed Muhit

Name of BOR Member: Gamal Alturki

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Yeasmin Sultana


BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

Name of BOR Member: Mohammed Muhit

BOR Member Vote: **AYE**

 12-21-2023

**Ashley Fallon**  
Recording Secretary

 12-21-2023

**Thomas D. Monchak**  
Secretary